

THE GEONIC TALMUD

**The Attitude of Babylonian Geonim to the Text
of the Babylonian Talmud**

Uziel Fuchs

THE GEONIC TALMUD

**The Attitude of Babylonian Geonim to the
Text of the Babylonian Talmud**

האיגוד העולמי למדעי היהדות
WORLD UNION OF JEWISH STUDIES



HERZOG
Academic College
Research Authority

ESHKOLOT



Jewish Studies Series

Edited by Amos Geula

The Geonic Talmud
**The Attitude of Babylonian Geonim to the Text of
the Babylonian Talmud**

Academic Committee:

Robert Brody • Simcha Emanuel • David Henshke

Jerusalem 2017

© All rights reserved

Herzog Academic College • World Union of Jewish Studies

Printed in Israel

ISBN 978-965-92115-3-1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	9
Part One	
Chapter One: Introduction	13
The Versions of the Talmud of the <i>Geonim</i> in the Writings of the <i>Rishonim</i>	13
The Versions of the <i>Geonim</i> : A History of Scholarly Research	17
From the <i>Amoraim</i> to the <i>Geonim</i>	24
<i>Amoraim, Savoraim, and Geonim</i>	25
Possible Traces of Another Editing of the Babylonian Talmud in <i>Geonic</i> Literature	27
Between Babylonia and the Diaspora and the Arrival of the Babylonian Talmud in the Diaspora	30
Chapter Two: The <i>Yeshivot</i> of the <i>Geonim</i> and the Background of the Formation of Variant Versions of the Talmud	34
The <i>Yeshivot</i> of the <i>Geonim</i> : The Description of Rabbi Nathan the Babylonian	35
Holders of positions in the <i>Yeshiva</i>	37
Methods of Study	43
Chapter Three: Oral or Written Talmud: Testimony of the <i>Geonim</i>	48
Opinions regarding the Writing of the Oral Law	48
Oral Learning in the <i>Geonic</i> Period: Reality	51
Oral Learning in the <i>Geonic</i> Period: An Ideological Stance	55
Early Manuscripts of the Oral Law	59
The Use of Books of the Talmud in the Later <i>Geonic</i> Period	63
From the <i>Geonim</i> to the <i>Rishonim</i> : Changing Oral into Written Terminology	69

Oral and Written Study in the <i>Geonic</i> Period: Reality and Weltanschauung	72
“And if one recites ... perhaps, he will do so from the written text”	77
The Cultural Milieu	78
Duplication of the Means of Transmission	80
Appendix A: The <i>Gemara Debei Rav Yishai (Ashi)</i>	82
Appendix B: From the Oral to the Written: Euphemisms	85
Chapter Four: Discussions of the <i>Geonim</i> regarding the Versions of the Talmud: Personalities and Motives	87
The Beginnings of Dealing with the Talmudic Text	87
Reasons and Motives	89
Responsa regarding Matters of the Versions of the Text	90
Textual Discussions in Responsa on <i>Halakhah</i> and Commentary	94
Discussions in <i>Geonic</i> Writings regarding the Versions of the Talmud	97
Chapter Five: The Method of the <i>Geonim</i> in Clarifying the Versions of the Talmud: Characterization and Standards of Evaluation	100
Commentary as a Standard for Evaluating Versions of the Text	100
Compatibility with the <i>Halakhah</i>	102
Explanations for the Existence of “Incorrect” Versions of the Text	102
Reliance upon Traditions and Figures of Authority	104
Definitions and Characterizations	117
Summary and Conclusion	136
Chapter Six: The Attitude of the <i>Geonim</i> to Multiple Versions of the Text of the Talmud	140
Correcting the Versions of the Text	142
Did the <i>Geonim</i> wish to Force Rabbis in the Diaspora to accept their Versions of the Text of the Talmud?	141
Recognition of the Versions of the Text	143
Combining Correction of the Texts with Recognition	145
Chapter Seven: Rabbi Hai Gaon’s Emendation of the Talmud	147
Definitive Emendations	147
Opposition to Emendations	151
Rabbi Hai Gaon’s Emendations in the Statements of the <i>Rishonim</i>	152

Chapter Eight: The Talmud in the Period of the <i>Geonim</i>:	
Textual Discussions of the <i>Geonim</i> and Beyond	154
The Importance of Rabbi Sherira Gaon and Rabbi Hai Gaon	155
A Multiplicity of Versions of the Text in the Geonic Period	158
The Attitude of the <i>Geonim</i> toward the Different Versions of the Text	159
The Question of the “Version of the Text of the <i>Yeshivot</i> ”	160
Were there Differences between the Sura and Pumbeditha Versions?	162
The Nature of the Versions of the Text of the <i>Geonim</i> :	
Preserved and Ancient, or, Adapted and Late	164
The Preference for the “Meaning” (<i>Ta’am</i>) and the Concept of	
Language of the Later <i>Geonim</i>	168
Orality and Literacy	174
The Influence of the Versions of the <i>Geonim</i> upon the Tradition	
of the Text of the Talmud	176
From the <i>Geonim</i> to the <i>Rishonim</i>	179
Part Two	
Anthology of Sources: The Discussions of the <i>Geonim</i> regarding the Versions of the Mishna and the Talmud	181
Introduction	183
The Way of Presenting the Sources	183
Methodological Problems	185
Textual Phenomena that Find Expression in the Anthology of Sources	188
List of Symbols	196
Anthology of Sources	197
<i>Berakhot</i> 197, <i>Mo’ed</i> 255, <i>Nashim</i> 355, <i>Nezikin</i> 410, <i>Kodashim</i> and <i>Tohorot</i> 483	
Extracts that are not according to the Order of the Talmud	497
Appendix: Doubts, Unfounded Assumptions and Errors	501
Bibliography	515
Indices	546